

CITY OF VANCOUVER  
SPECIAL COUNCIL MEETING

A Special Meeting of the Vancouver City Council was held on Tuesday, November 9, 1976, at approximately 7:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber, third floor, City Hall to consider designation of heritage structures.

PRESENT: Mayor Phillips  
Aldermen Bird, Boyce, Cowie, Harcourt,  
Kennedy, Marzari, Rankin and  
Sweeney

ABSENT: Alderman Volrich

CLERK TO THE COUNCIL: M. Kinsella

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

MOVED by Ald. Rankin,  
SECONDED by Ald. Harcourt,

THAT this Council resolve itself into Committee of the Whole, Mayor Phillips in the Chair.

- CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

1. List of Buildings Recommended  
for Designation as Heritage  
Structures

Council had for consideration a list and descriptions of 25 buildings which Council's Heritage Advisory Committee recommended be designated as heritage buildings.

Following a brief introduction on the recommendations by Heritage Advisory Committee member Prof. R. McLeod and Chairman, Mrs. J. Fleming, the Mayor called for delegations and representations were received as follows:

- Mr. Jonathan Baker appeared on behalf of MEPC Canadian Properties, owners of The Commodore at 840-872 Granville Street, and spoke in opposition to the recommendation that the building be designated. Mr. Baker presented copies of an evaluation of the heritage merits of this building by planning and development consultant Michael Seelig, which concluded that his investigations have shown many people with pleasant memories of The Commodore would gladly see it make room for new and better uses.
- Mr. J. Clarke and Mr. J. McConnachie, representatives of the Army, Navy and Airforce Veterans' Association, Unit 20, owners of the Lyric Theatre at 300 West Pender Street, stated that designation of their building would make it very difficult for them to sell the property for redevelopment.
- Mr. Frank Low-Beer appeared for DPG Holdings Limited, owners of the house located at 1301 West 7th Avenue and spoke to a letter (circulated) from Mr. Francesco Piccone, President of DPG Holdings, which stated the house is in poor condition, is not large enough to make it economical to spend money on and that designation would impose undue hardship on the owners. The letter offered the house to the City for \$1.00 and pointed out the structure is small enough to be moved from its present site.
- Rev. R.G. Kilgour presented Council with a brief (circulated) opposing the designation of Chalmers United Church, 2801 Hemlock Street. The brief stated the congregation is in a precarious financial position and that designation would place severe restrictions on any alternative use of the site.
- Ms. Margaret Fulton addressed Council in opposition to the designation of Chalmers United Church stating designation would prevent future redevelopment of the property.

cont'd....

Special Council, November 9, 1976 . . . . . 2

List of Buildings Recommended  
for Designation as Heritage  
Structures (cont'd)

- Mr. Irving Sirlin submitted a brief to Council (circulated) opposing the designation of the large home he owns at 1119 Broughton Street. Mr. Sirlin displayed an architect's conception of a nine-unit townhouse development which he stated could be placed on the site some time in the future. He suggested there should be some compensation for heritage designation.
- Mr. D. Gillenders addressed Council in opposition to the designation of the Vancouver Club at 915 West Hastings Street and submitted a brief from Mr. Brenton Brown of the Vancouver Club (circulated) asking Council not to proceed with designation until a full study of the economic alternatives has been completed and necessary amendments made to the City Charter to provide for compensation for designation.
- Mr. Richard Mann appeared before Council on behalf of Sunco Enterprises, owners of the Manhattan Apartment building located at 784 Thurlow Street. Mr. Mann submitted a brief (copies circulated) advising the owners for the past year and one-half have examined all possible methods of retaining this 55-unit residential building, but that retention is economically prohibited. Mr. Mann stated one proposal to expand the building was refused mortgage funding by CMHC. Mr. Mann requested the building not be designated or that designation be postponed six to eight months to allow discussions on how to preserve the building to continue with the Planning Department.
- Mr. D.C. Prowse appeared on behalf of Mr. Mano Herendy, owner of the Leslie House at 1380 Hornby Street. Mr. Prowse spoke to a letter from architect Mr. P. Kaffka (circulated) which stated that whatever architectural merit this house may have had, has been destroyed by the insensitive siting of a new development immediately to the south and that designation cannot be justified.
- Mr. Treit addressed Council and stated he does not understand the recommendation to designate the Rush Building at 416 Richards Street. He is fundamentally opposed to the designation and suggested that if the citizens of Vancouver are to have a monument, they should pay for it.
- Mr. M. Chambers of Hamersley Holdings Limited, owners of the Takehera Tenements at 1017 West 7th Avenue, appeared before Council and spoke to a letter (circulated) which stated that Hamersley Holdings welcomes steps being taken by the City to preserve its historic buildings. The letter stated the City should pass a By-law that no development permit be granted to properties adjacent to heritage buildings where such development would detrimentally affect heritage buildings.
- Mr. J.W. Duncan appeared on behalf of the First Baptist Church at 969 Burrard Street and stated designation of this Church could cause financial problems in the future and requested that if the Church is designated, there should be some compensation by the City.
- Mr. R.Y. Bonner from Cumming, Richards, Underhill, Fraser, Skillings requested that as Mr. R. Baker was unable to attend this meeting, consideration of the designation of the Watson House at 909 Thurlow Street be deferred until such time as Mr. Baker can appear before Council on behalf of the owners.

cont'd....

Special Council, November 9, 1976 . . . . . 3

List of Buildings Recommended  
for Designation as Heritage  
Structures (cont'd)

The Council noted communications which were before it for consideration as follows:

- (a) Letter from the Vancouver School Board requesting Council defer consideration of designating a portion of Lord Strathcona School to a later date when representatives of the Board can be present.
- (b) Letter from Cumming, Richards, Underhill, Fraser, Skillings, Barristers & Solicitors on behalf of Mr. J. Kucera, requesting Council defer consideration of designating 909 Thurlow Street until Mr. Kucera can appear before Council.
- (c) Letter from the Chairman of the Park Board advising of the Board's resolution that it has no objection to the designation of the Alexandra Park Bandstand and no objection to designation of the Old Roedde House, as long as Council is aware of the costs of designating Roedde House including possible relocation.
- (d) Letter from Rev. McSherry advising that a considerable majority of the congregation at St. Paul's Church are delighted over the pending designation of the Church.
- (e) Letter from Mr. McRae of Alberta Lumber Company opposed to the designation of the Alberta Lumber Company at 709 West 6th Avenue.

MOVED by Ald. Rankin,  
THAT the foregoing communications be received.

- CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

(At this point, Alderman Marzari left the meeting)

MOVED by Ald. Cowie,  
THAT Chalmers United Church, 2801 Hemlock Street, be designated a "B" category heritage building.

- CARRIED BY THE  
REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Alderman Sweeney opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,  
THAT Douglas Lodge, 2799 Granville Street, be designated a "B" category heritage building.

- CARRIED BY THE  
REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Alderman Kennedy opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Cowie,  
THAT the designation of Burnett House, 1301 West 7th Avenue, be deferred for three months to determine if the City wished to accept the owner's offer to sell it this building for \$1.00.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Bird, Kennedy, Rankin, Sweeney and the Mayor opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,  
THAT Burnett House, 1301 West 7th Avenue, be designated an 'A' category heritage building.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Bird, Cowie, Kennedy, Rankin, Sweeney and the Mayor opposed)

cont'd....

Special Council, November 9, 1976 . . . . . 4

List of Buildings Recommended  
for Designation as Heritage  
Structures (cont'd)

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,  
THAT the Takehera Tenements at 1017 West 7th Avenue be  
designated an "A" category heritage building.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Bird, Cowie, Kennedy, Rankin, Sweeney  
and the Mayor opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,  
THAT the Alberta Lumber Company at 790 West 6th Avenue be  
designated a "B" category heritage building.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Bird, Kennedy, Rankin, Sweeney and the  
Mayor opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,  
THAT Leslie House at 1380 Hornby Street be designated an  
"A" category heritage building.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Bird, Boyce, Cowie, Kennedy, Rankin, Sweeney  
and the Mayor opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,  
THAT Alexandra Park Bandstand on Beach Avenue at Burnaby  
Street be designated an "A" category heritage structure.

- CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND  
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,  
THAT Hirshfield House at 1963 Comox Street be designated  
an "A" category heritage building.

- CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND  
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

MOVED by Ald. Boyce,  
THAT Roedde House at 1415 Barclay Street be designated  
an "A" category heritage building.

- CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND  
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,  
THAT Fee House at 1119 Broughton Street be designated a  
"B" category heritage building.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Bird, Cowie, Kennedy, Rankin, Sweeney  
and the Mayor opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Cowie,  
THAT St. Paul's Church at 1138 Jarvis Street be designated  
an "A" category heritage building.

- CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND  
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

cont'd....

Special Council, November 9, 1976 . . . . . 5

List of Buildings Recommended  
for Designation as Heritage  
Structures (cont'd)

MOVED by Ald. Cowie,

THAT the First Baptist Church at 969 Burrard Street be designated an "A" category heritage building.

- CARRIED BY THE  
REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Alderman Sweeney opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Cowie,

THAT Council defer consideration of the designation of the Manhattan Apartments, 784 Thurlow Street for up to nine months.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Bird, Kennedy, Sweeney and the Mayor opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,

THAT Council defer consideration of the designation of the Manhattan Apartments, 784 Thurlow Street, for three months.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Bird, Cowie, Kennedy, Rankin, Sweeney and the Mayor opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,

THAT Council designate the Manhattan Apartments at 784 Thurlow Street as a "B" category heritage building.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Bird, Boyce, Cowie, Kennedy, Rankin, Sweeney and the Mayor opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Cowie,

THAT the Manhattan Apartments at 784 Thurlow Street be placed on the Heritage Advisory Committee's list of "C" category heritage buildings.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Kennedy and Rankin opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Cowie,

THAT Council defer consideration for one month the designation of Watson House at 909 Thurlow Street to allow Mr. R. Baker or the owners to appear before Council.

- CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND  
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,

THAT Council designate the Palms Hotel at 869-873 Granville Street as a "B" category heritage building.

- CARRIED BY THE  
REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Alderman Kennedy opposed)

(At this point, Alderman Marzari returned to the meeting)

MOVED by Ald. Cowie,

THAT Council designate The Commodore at 840-872 Granville Street as a "B" category heritage building.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Bird, Kennedy and Sweeney opposed)

cont'd....

Special Council, November 9, 1976 . . . . . 6

List of Buildings Recommended  
for Designation as Heritage  
Structures (cont'd)

MOVED by Ald. Cowie,

THAT The Commodore at 840-872 Granville Street be placed on the Heritage Advisory Committee's list of "C" category heritage buildings.

- CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND  
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

MOVED by Ald. Boyce,

THAT the Bank of Commerce at 819 Granville Street be designated a "B" category heritage building.

- CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND  
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,

THAT the Hudson's Bay Insurance Company at 924 West Hastings Street be designated a "B" category heritage building.

- CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND  
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,

THAT the Vancouver Club at 915 West Hastings Street be designated an "A" category heritage building.

- CARRIED BY THE  
REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Alderman Sweeney opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,

THAT the Bank of B.C. or Rush Building at 416 Richards Street be designated a "B" category heritage building.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Bird, Kennedy and Sweeney opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Rankin,

THAT the Lyric Theatre at 300 West Pender Street be designated a "B" category heritage building.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Bird and Sweeney and the Mayor opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Harcourt,

THAT the Hessen and Irving building at 100 East Hastings Street be designated a "B" category heritage building.

- LOST NOT HAVING RECEIVED  
THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Aldermen Bird, Boyce, Cowie, Kennedy, Rankin, Sweeney and the Mayor opposed)

MOVED by Ald. Bird,

THAT St. Luke's Home at 305 East Cordova Street be designated a "B" category heritage building.

- CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND  
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

MOVED by Ald. Kennedy,

THAT Lord Strathcona School at 592 East Pender Street be designated an "A" category heritage building.

- CARRIED BY THE  
REQUIRED MAJORITY

(Alderman Bird opposed)

cont'd....

Special Council, November 9, 1976 . . . . . 7

List of Buildings Recommended  
for Designation as Heritage  
Structures (cont'd)

MOVED by Ald. Kennedy,

THAT the Ukrainian Greek Orthodox Church at 154 East 10th Avenue be designated an "A" category heritage building.

(not put)

At this point, a representative of the congregation of the Ukrainian Greek Orthodox Church asked that Council defer consideration of designating the Ukrainian Greek Orthodox Church to allow the congregation time to study the effect of such designation.

MOVED by Ald. Rankin,

THAT Council defer consideration for one month of the designation of the Ukrainian Greek Orthodox Church.

- CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND  
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

The Director of Legal Services suggested that any By-law to designate "B" category heritage buildings should be subject to the Heritage Advisory Committee's clarifying those parts of "B" buildings which it wishes to be designated in the "B" schedule. The Mayor so directed.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

MOVED by Ald. Rankin,

THAT the Committee of the Whole rise and report.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

MOVED by Ald. Rankin,

SECONDED by Ald. Harcourt,

THAT the report of the Committee of the Whole be adopted and the Director of Legal Services prepare and submit to Council the necessary By-law to so designate.

- CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

- - - - -

The Council adjourned at approximately 10:15 p.m.

- - - - -

The foregoing are Minutes of the Special Council Meeting of November 9, 1976, adopted on November 23, 1976.

A. Phillips  
MAYOR

B. J. L. L.  
CITY CLERK